

Equivalency of Protection from Natural Immunity in COVID-19 Recovered Versus Fully Vaccinated Persons: A Systematic Review and Pooled Analysis

mR medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2021.09.12.21263461v1

Abstract

BACKGROUND We present a systematic review and pooled analysis of clinical studies to date, that (1) specifically compare the protection of natural immunity in the COVID-recovered versus the efficacy of full vaccination in the COVID-naïve, and (2) the added benefit of vaccination in the COVID-recovered, for prevention of subsequent SARS-CoV-2 infection.

METHODS Using the PRISMA 2020 guidance, we first conducted a systematic review of available literature on PubMed, MedRxIV and FDA briefings to identify clinical studies either comparing COVID vaccination to natural immunity or delineating the benefit of vaccination in recovered individuals. After assessing for eligibility, studies were qualitatively appraised and formally graded using the NOS system for observational, case-control and RCTs. Incidence rates were tabulated for the following groups: never infected (NI) and unvaccinated (UV), NI and vaccinated (V), previously infected (PI) and UV, PI and UV. Pooling was performed by grouping the RCTs and observational studies separately, and then all studies in total. Risk ratios and risk differences are reported for individual studies and pooled groups, in 1) NPI/V vs. PI/UV and 2) PI/UV vs. PI/V analysis. In addition, number needed to treat (NNT) analysis was performed for vaccination in naïve and previously infected cohorts.

RESULTS Nine clinical studies were identified including three randomized controlled studies, four retrospective observational cohorts, one prospective observational cohort, and a case-control study. The NOS quality appraisals of these articles ranged from four to nine (out of nine stars). All of the included studies found at least statistical equivalence between the protection of full vaccination and natural immunity; and, three studies found superiority of natural immunity. Four observational studies found a statistically significant incremental benefit to vaccination in the COVID-recovered individuals. In total pooled analysis, incidence in NPI/V trended higher than PI/UV groups (RR=1.86 [95%CI 0.77-4.51], P=0.17). Vaccination in COVID-recovered individuals provided modest protection from reinfection (RR=1.82 [95%CI 1.21-2.73], P=0.004), but the absolute risk difference was extremely small (AR= 0.004 person-years [95% CI 0.001-0.007], P=0.02). The NNT to prevent one annual case of infection in COVID-recovered patients was 218, compared to 6.5 in COVID-naïve patients, representing a 33.5-fold difference in benefit between the two populations.

CONCLUSIONS While vaccinations are highly effective at protecting against infection and severe COVID-19 disease, our review demonstrates that natural immunity in COVID-recovered individuals is, at least, equivalent to the protection afforded by full vaccination of COVID-naïve populations. There is a modest and incremental relative benefit to vaccination in COVID-recovered individuals; however, the net benefit is marginal on an absolute basis. COVID-recovered individuals represent a distinctly different benefit-risk calculus. Therefore, vaccination of COVID-recovered individuals should be subject to clinical equipoise and individual preference.

Competing Interest Statement

The authors have declared no competing interest.

Funding Statement

No external funding was received.

Author Declarations

I confirm all relevant ethical guidelines have been followed, and any necessary IRB and/or ethics committee approvals have been obtained.

Yes

The details of the IRB/oversight body that provided approval or exemption for the research described are given below:

This is a systematic review and metaanalysis, and therefore, does not need IRB approval.

All necessary patient/participant consent has been obtained and the appropriate institutional forms have been archived.

Yes

I understand that all clinical trials and any other prospective interventional studies must be registered with an ICMJE-approved registry, such as ClinicalTrials.gov. I confirm that any such study reported in the manuscript has been registered and the trial registration ID is provided (note: if posting a prospective study registered retrospectively, please provide a statement in the trial ID field explaining why the study was not registered in advance).

Yes

I have followed all appropriate research reporting guidelines and uploaded the relevant EQUATOR Network research reporting checklist(s) and other pertinent material as supplementary files, if applicable.

Yes

Footnotes

Disclaimer: This article is a preliminary work, and has not undergone peer review. While all data, calculations, tables and figures have been reviewed by the authors, errors and omissions may be present in this draft, and should not guide clinical practice or decision making. The article represents solely the work of the authors, and do not represent the views of their affiliated organizations. Updated and revised versions will be forthcoming.

Paper in collection **COVID-19 SARS-CoV-2 preprints from medRxiv and bioRxiv**

Copyright

The copyright holder for this preprint is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

Tweets referencing this article:

Naturally Immune

@GulagMember0515

@Shariinthesky @Rbinswanger7 @RepThomasMassie <https://t.co/k3OE67Oxim>
<https://t.co/oF74PdNow2> <https://t.co/ppbrU6BLqz> <https://t.co/dPh2NMNYTv>
<https://t.co/nmUi9clItt> Variant protection with natural immunity: <https://t.co/f3sBhZFKLZ>
<https://t.co/TH7xB6Yo3R>

09:08PM

Naturally Immune

@GulagMember0515

@tcheramy @Joeswife321 @ksorbs <https://t.co/oF74PdNow2> <https://t.co/ppbrU6BLqz>
<https://t.co/dPh2NMNYTv> <https://t.co/nmUi9clItt> Variant protection with natural
immunity: <https://t.co/f3sBhZFKLZ> <https://t.co/TH7xB6Yo3R> <https://t.co/vDICCEK53l>
<https://t.co/t>

06:57PM

Haluka Maier-Borst

@HalukaMB

@papajoedoe @katzenvideos1 @DirkBrockmann @BenFMaier <https://t.co/qvNzUPPH9V>
<https://t.co/g6kdAj2Ps5> Nur mal so als Anfang. Die Impfung ist mindestens äquivalent zur Infektion mit deutlich weniger Nebenwirkungen. Und die polnische Studie zeigt, dass auch

06:11PM

Gunter DW

@metricalsystem

@catameep @Dave99117584 @JuliaRaifman @EricTopol Anyway the news that Omicron increases the chance of getting reinfected is bad news for all of us, not only the unvaccinated. I think a lot of people don't realize this. <https://t.co/Hs8omsqc1H>

06:18AM

Naturally Immune

@GulagMember0515

@QNTistheKEY <https://t.co/k3OE67Oxim> <https://t.co/oF74PdNow2>
<https://t.co/ppbrU6BLqz> <https://t.co/dPh2NMNYTv> <https://t.co/nmUi9clItt> Variant protection with natural immunity: <https://t.co/f3sBhZFKLZ> <https://t.co/TH7xB6Yo3R>

01 Dec 2021

J J

@jjohnson_abc

@NickHudsonCT Spanish Flu immunity still present and functioning after 90 years, also RNA Influenza: <https://t.co/aU500mF14I>

28 Nov 2021

Michelle Russell

@Michello3389211

@SkyNews <https://t.co/fxTG6nTZik> <https://t.co/77kFdHGV11> <https://t.co/qa1hUHWPvm>
<https://t.co/yv6ZSFA13x> <https://t.co/EsEw96ULHd> <https://t.co/CMBAcZbeox>
<https://t.co/7HfT5miKlq> <https://t.co/YJg7oIFyaB> <https://t.co/HpsbdSzSl8>
<https://t.co/snyXE3ERmf>

27 Nov 2021

Michelle Russell

@Michello3389211

@guardian <https://t.co/EsEw96ULHd> <https://t.co/CMBAcZbeox> <https://t.co/7HfT5miKlq>

26 Nov 2021

Michelle Russell

@Michello3389211

@DailyMailUK The elephant in the room: Long-lasting, effective natural immunity which binds vaccine resistant variants. <https://t.co/2KxhpwbrmX> <https://t.co/Ff4xECi1H4> <https://t.co/7Hy39jT7Hx> <https://t.co/mIxidMbsW5> <https://t.co/77kFdHGV11> <https://t.c>

26 Nov 2021

Michelle Russell

@Michello3389211

@DailyMirror The elephant in the room: Long-lasting, effective natural immunity which binds vaccine resistant variants. <https://t.co/2KxhpwbrmX> <https://t.co/Ff4xECi1H4> <https://t.co/7Hy39jT7Hx> <https://t.co/mIxidMbsW5> <https://t.co/77kFdHGV11> <https://t.c>

26 Nov 2021

J J

@jjohnson_abc

@RameseSanders @KathySm59005579 Very interesting! Body mounts an immune response? Hence, the + IgG? I understand immense false positive possibilities w PCR. How do we explain the Spanish Flu of 1918? What were the researchers measuring in 2008 that made th

25 Nov 2021

J J

@jjohnson_abc

@ClownBasket Where's 'Recovered From Covid'? For a true infection, not just a positive PCR test, we fully anticipate lifelong protection just like we saw 90 years later after the Spanish flu of 1918. <https://t.co/aU500mF14I>

25 Nov 2021

John

[@J6109233](#)

[@Sporaticus](#) [@HealthyFla](#) For others following along: <https://t.co/P81gGr77QW>
<https://t.co/GzOdFOrpM5> <https://t.co/U14MQS28EP> <https://t.co/Vt8aYyLcKA>

23 Nov 2021

Michelle Russell

[@Michello3389211](#)

[@alinabotezatu](#) [@FT](#) [@richardursomd](#) [@RWMaloneMD](#) [@PierreKory](#) Umm, no. One dose with waning effectiveness gave benefit, which included risk of side effects such as myocarditis, thrombosis, auto-immune disease etc. How many studies do you want?
<https://t.co/Ff4>

21 Nov 2021

Daniel Goldman | dgoldman.eth

[@alc_anthro](#)

[@Oxfordite](#) [@schwarmerei1](#) [@MackayIM](#) Woops. Here's the systematic review:
<https://t.co/ZzWd5YOPT1>

21 Nov 2021

Bob

[@sk8ter_bobby](#)

[@AlicesCupofTea1](#) [@HouleEvelyne](#) [@flstudiom4ster](#) [@MagChange_73](#) Il faut prendre ce que votre "expert" dit avec un gros grain de sel. Premièrement c'est un neurochirurgien... pas un expert dans ce domaine. Deuxièmement, l'étude qu'il critique donne des résultats

21 Nov 2021

MakingSense

[@ofitmakingsense](#)

[@LibertyLucas26](#) Equivalency of Protection from Natural Immunity in COVID-19 Recovered Versus Fully Vaccinated Persons: A Systematic Review and Pooled Analysis
<https://t.co/zPhjIFKSeX> <https://t.co/1mhXisd9qv>

21 Nov 2021

Metis

@Metis995

@Crom72143396 @DarrellBendall Ce n'est pas parce que les médias ont répété en boucle une information biaisée basée sur une étude officielle présentant des défauts de méthodologie majeurs qu'elle est vraie, mais restez dans votre fantasme si ça vous chante.

18 Nov 2021

H.L. Greenberg, M.D.

@hlgreenberg

@MoreLemonPledge @FOX5Vegas @MGMResortsIntl @CCMSNevada @SNHDinfo That's because the dead are not immune- they are the weakest of the herd- the strongest survived. I had a patient who survived Polio at 3 years old- asked him if he got the polio vaccine- he

18 Nov 2021

CanadianGrandma

@frugalsues

@JoshofDCx @Minnie1114 @Hobnob96074107 @MissyCyberpunk @Crippsy1969
@farr_tammy @SassyGirlD1 @Chris_F_Carson @MattMcInnis6 @romromtin
@Spike78495410 @over_711 @garth_moore @Rose_McIntyre77 @Ladyw_IronRing It's a thread ... READ <https://t.co/7lnoloANYW> https:

18 Nov 2021

SeeJaneVote

@janiedelaney

Equivalency of Protection from Natural Immunity in COVID-19 Recovered Versus Fully Vaccinated Persons: A Systematic Review and Pooled Analysis <https://t.co/IaeTPeJANu>

17 Nov 2021

D

@dleivl

@TwitterMoments @CDCgov <https://t.co/EVn4lEHaL6> <https://t.co/OeqoehIRBv>

16 Nov 2021

vIad□

@dovglad

@MikeHaddadMD @CountyofLambton ...natural immunity is at least equivalent, if not superior, to vax immunity - and that the added benefit of vax in COVID-recovered persons is slight. <https://t.co/jOopscpO65>

16 Nov 2021

John

@J6109233

@thejabbermonkey @TB Times And finally a pooled analysis of 9 studies indicating that natural immunity is at least as strong as vax immunity. Feel free to rebut with the CDC study which had 5 authors disclose conflicts of interest receiving funds from vax

16 Nov 2021

Sabeth Pademira

@Sabeth_Pademira

@DanielPach6 @MrsCgn <https://t.co/bkzgc3efO6>

16 Nov 2021

fred h ciarlo jr

@fhcjr38

@canadavsengland @JanJekielek @EpochTimes Here's one I found Lemme see what else I can find: <https://t.co/OS6xoeFLkD>

16 Nov 2021

NickyBoko

@BokoNicky

RT @markvanasten: "All of the included studies (15!) found at least statistical equivalence between the protection of full vaccination and..."

15 Nov 2021

Tickled Pink

@TickledP1nk

RT [@markvanasten](#): “All of the included studies (15!) found at least statistical equivalence between the protection of full vaccination and...

15 Nov 2021

Mark van Asten

@markvanasten

RT [@markvanasten](#): “All of the included studies (15!) found at least statistical equivalence between the protection of full vaccination and...

15 Nov 2021

Rosarot

@zweilizweire

RT [@Thomas_Wilckens](#): [#Immunity](#) to SARS-CoV-2 15 months after infection <https://t.co/ZYFfVYHviL> Reviews: Protective Effect of Prior [#coronav...](#)

14 Nov 2021

Dr. Thomas Wilckens

@Thomas_Wilckens

RT [@Thomas_Wilckens](#): Lesenswerte Studie und Reviews zu Immunität nach [#Coroanvirusinfektion](#) vs Schutz durch [#Impfung](#) [@Dt_Aerzteblatt](#) [@aerz...](#)

14 Nov 2021

jake teater

@jaketeater

[@FredBVKarl](#) [@hollymathnerd](#) If you are interested in looking into the protection provided by previous infection, this review (which is a pre-print) cites many resources. <https://t.co/RK8HT5han1>

13 Nov 2021

Who's here hoosier

@whosherehoosier

@BestinthePNW @Av8rParent @MonicaGandhi9 @ReallycorrectC Except the occasional outlier (like the bizarre recent CDC study), studies are pretty consistent that on average, "natural immunity" is as protective as vaccine-induced immunity. Here's a nice analy

13 Nov 2021

Linda Lake

@llakeatthebay

RT @QNTistheKEY: 4. Equivalency of Protection from Natural Immunity in COVID-19 Recovered Versus Fully Vaccinated Persons: A Systematic Rev...

11 Nov 2021

NJReligiousFreedom

@Njreligious

<https://t.co/WGCBOXA6WT>

10 Nov 2021

NJReligiousFreedom

@Njreligious

@PHILCP69 " our review demonstrates that natural immunity in COVID-recovered individuals is, at least, equivalent to the protection afforded by full vaccination of COVID-naïve populations. " <https://t.co/qSfWNPX3Z7>

10 Nov 2021

The Biscuit (Sausage/Gravy)

@mtylermartin

@APFactCheck <https://t.co/wbeIV4Ar33> How do you explain these results?

09 Nov 2021

The Biscuit (Sausage/Gravy)

@mtylermartin

@nwhalen902 @bigtidybidies @Plunancie @21mbk21 @PatMcAfeeShow

@AaronRodgers12 Here's a 9-study meta comparing natural immunity to vaccine-induced immunity. Natural Immunity is that thing the media completely ignores to Cuck for Pfizer,

and harangue peop

09 Nov 2021

J J

@jjohnson_abc

@MichaelPSenger 100+ studies prove it. See how arrogant they truly are. Here's a very scientific journal saying the same, the cannot say don't vax because all the funding for everything is tied to getting these shots out and to work (clotting and needing m

09 Nov 2021

B. Baruj

@b_baruj

RT @sarapty: Equivalency of Protection from Natural Immunity in COVID-19 Recovered Versus Fully Vaccinated Persons: A Systematic Review and...

08 Nov 2021

Yareli GVña

@YixyeiG

RT @sarapty: Equivalency of Protection from Natural Immunity in COVID-19 Recovered Versus Fully Vaccinated Persons: A Systematic Review and...

08 Nov 2021

Bambito

@bambito

RT @sarapty: Equivalency of Protection from Natural Immunity in COVID-19 Recovered Versus Fully Vaccinated Persons: A Systematic Review and...

08 Nov 2021

sara bassan

@sarapty

Equivalency of Protection from Natural Immunity in COVID-19 Recovered Versus Fully Vaccinated Persons: A Systematic Review and Pooled Analysis | medRxiv
<https://t.co/abF2NTrxdJ>

08 Nov 2021

Sylvia Fogel MD

@FogelSylvia

"our review demonstrates that natural immunity in COVID-recovered individuals is, at least, equivalent to the protection afforded by full vaccination of COVID-naïve populations."

<https://t.co/UGPuDtIrjH>

08 Nov 2021

Phil

@Phil74010610

@APFactCheck <https://t.co/EZkfbpWWpJ>

07 Nov 2021

BIOLOGIC SUPPLY CHAINS (JABS) MY SPECIALTY

@hedleyrees

RT @SabinaWalker18: @stacey_rudin @TomEvan81013762 You must be too healthy for Big Pharma's liking! I wonder if the following thread  on...

07 Nov 2021

Marquez de la Plata

@capnmike

RT @Thomas_Wilckens: #Immunity to SARS-CoV-2 15 months after infection <https://t.co/ZYFfVYHviL> Reviews: Protective Effect of Prior #coronav...

07 Nov 2021

Rosarot

@zweilizweire

RT @Thomas_Wilckens: Lesenswerte Studie und Reviews zu Immunität nach #Coroanvirusinfektion vs Schutz durch #Impfung @Dt_Aerzteblatt @aerz...

07 Nov 2021

Dr. Thomas Wilckens

@Thomas_Wilckens

Lesenswerte Studie und Reviews zu Immunität nach #Coroanvirusinfektion vs Schutz durch #Impfung @Dt_Aerzteblatt @aerztezeitung @bvmd_de @bjae_aerzte @BAEKaktuell @kbv4u #coronavirus #covid19

07 Nov 2021

April, #NoVaccinePassportsAnywhere


@Webcrazy

RT @SabinaWalker18: @stacey_rudin @TomEvan81013762 You must be too healthy for Big Pharma's liking! I wonder if the following thread  on...

07 Nov 2021

Sabina Walker  Master Appl Science (Neuroscience)

@SabinaWalker18

@stacey_rudin @TomEvan81013762 You must be too healthy for Big Pharma's liking! I wonder if the following thread  on #NaturalImmunity (~120 links and counting) may interest #ImmunityDeniers?? <https://t.co/FYMW1mxhdo>

07 Nov 2021

Dr.GOTT

@IGFarbenVaccin

RT @Thomas_Wilckens: #Immunity to SARS-CoV-2 15 months after infection <https://t.co/ZYFfVYHviL> Reviews: Protective Effect of Prior #coronav...

07 Nov 2021

Sabina Walker  Master Appl Science (Neuroscience)

@SabinaWalker18

122/x Equivalency of Protection from Natural Immunity in COVID-19 Recovered Versus Fully Vaccinated Persons: A Systematic Review and Pooled Analysis <https://t.co/2dfPfv1wSc>

06 Nov 2021

Dr. Thomas Wilckens

@Thomas_Wilckens

#Immunity to SARS-CoV-2 15 months after infection <https://t.co/ZYFfVYHviL> Reviews: Protective Effect of Prior #coronavirus on Repeat Infection <https://t.co/RwXffC5Y2M> Equivalency of Protection from #NaturalImmunity in #COVID19 Recovered vs #Vaccinated [http](http://)

06 Nov 2021

Dr. Thomas Wilckens

@Thomas_Wilckens

#Immunity to SARS-CoV-2 15 months after infection <https://t.co/VNXoXGX7cM> Reviews: Protective Effect of Prior #coronavirus on Repeat Infection <https://t.co/ECAMYIbfUy> Equivalency of Protection from #NaturalImmunity in #COVID19 Recovered vs #Vaccinated [http](http://)

06 Nov 2021

John Dawson

@dawsonjohn95

Equivalency of Protection from Natural Immunity in COVID-19 Recovered Versus Fully Vaccinated Persons: A Systematic Review and Pooled Analysis | medRxiv <https://t.co/EubA3HKcAC>

05 Nov 2021

M RASAPPAN

@RasappanM

@APFactCheck <https://t.co/gUez6SWUoi> this is a systematic review of all published studies to date & clearly says natural immunity is at least equivalent to full vaccination. AP should apologize & retract the above piece of misinformation which is n

04 Nov 2021

Vaccines for All Matatu Operators

@sic_tangent

@miamalan Weirdly strong conclusion from such data when there are so many other studies coming to the opposite conclusion. Here data has a 0.4% incidence of breakthrough for "natural immunity" vs 0.3% for recovered vaccinated... Studies 👉👉 <https://t.co/INS>

04 Nov 2021

Alex G

@rodnreeljones

RT @dps5400: @APFactCheck Hahaha 🤔 anyone looking to “AP Fact Check” for this is just lost. <https://t.co/puOd7uPcn9>.

04 Nov 2021

Rs11

@Rs1183748470

RT @dps5400: @APFactCheck Hahaha 🤔 anyone looking to “AP Fact Check” for this is just lost. <https://t.co/puOd7uPcn9>.

04 Nov 2021

Dr. Thomas Wilckens

@Thomas_Wilckens

#Immunity to SARS-CoV-2 15 months after infection <https://t.co/Kdl1Ur8PxM> Reviews: Protective Effect of Prior #coronavirus on Repeat Infection <https://t.co/ntz5gZFGm8> Equivalency of Protection from #NaturalImmunity in #COVID19 Recovered vs #Vaccinated htt

04 Nov 2021

Dr. Thomas Wilckens

@Thomas_Wilckens

@Drjuergen_func @Nature #Immunity to SARS-CoV-2 15 months after infection <https://t.co/yPveGS5oRZ> Reviews: Protective Effect of Prior #coronavirus on Repeat Infection <https://t.co/SyqitJiG7g> Equivalency of Protection from #NaturalImmunity in #COVID19 Rec

04 Nov 2021